

Gas Transmission Northwest Compressor Station No. 12

Unit 12B Cost Effectiveness Calculation Update Based on Vendor Cost Quote

Based on recent discussions with DEQ, support documentation regarding SCR performance, and a cost quote for Station 12, Unit 12B, an updated cost effectiveness calculation spreadsheet follows. Notes regarding the analysis and changes from the 2020 submittal follow:

- Vendor cost quote is attached. In the two-week period between the February and March web meetings with DEQ, the vendor was able to provide a quote for one unit: 12B
- Changes to the previous submittal are highlighted in yellow in the Excel sheet / table below.
- Capital costs (including related costs in adjacent rows) were marginally increased based on the vendor quote. The vendor provided a cost range, and the upper end applies because “tempering air” system is needed to ensure the exhaust temperature at the catalyst inlet is less than the design maximum. For simple cycle turbines, higher exhaust temperature requires this system.
- Aqueous ammonia reagent cost updated based on vendor quote of hourly feed rate (i.e., 7.7 gallons per hour of 19% aqueous ammonia), assumed operating hours, and reagent cost of \$1.05 per gallon.
 - Aqueous ammonia cost per gallon from cost quote (attached) for delivery to site with 8,000 gallon tank. Fuel surcharge varies; costs provided (\$1.012 per gallon) rounded up to \$1.05 per gallon to include an estimate of fuel surcharge.
- Annual maintenance materials costs marginally increased based on vendor quote. (Note that additional review is continuing regarding potentially larger annual maintenance (labor) costs based on users’ experience.)
- In response to DEQ questions, an IES memo documents examples of SCR NO_x reduction performance for SCR application to natural gas transmission compressor drivers. That memo supports the assumption in the GTN 2020 four factor analysis that assumed 75% reduction (or even 70% reduction) for units 12A, 12B, 13C, and 13D.
- **Updated cost-effectiveness value is \$12,676 per ton**, assuming PSEL based on 8,760 operating hours. Additional examples assuming other operating hours or utilization:
 - Same as above with DEQ assumption of 90% control: \$10,563 per ton
 - 80% control: \$11,883 per ton
 - 75% control and 75% utilization: \$16,590 per ton
 - 75% control and future forecast of high-end utilization (42.5%): \$28,562 per ton

Table 2. Rolls Royce Avon Turbine (Unit 12B) SCR NOx Control Cost Effectiveness (100% utilization case).

NOx Control Cost Effectiveness Estimate				
Engine Manufacturer	Cooper-Rolls			
Model No.	Avon			
Unit ID	12B			
Fuel Used	Natural Gas			
Emissions Control	SCR			
Combustion Control Purpose	NOx			
Target Reduction	75%			
				Color Legend
				User Data / Information Input Cell
				"Cumulative" Cost Cell for Primary Categories
				Cost Effectiveness (\$ / ton)
1 Engine Design Conditions				Comments
Power Output	14300	(hp)		Rated HP
Engine Exhaust Temperature		(F)		optional input
Engine Exhaust Rate		(lb/hr)		optional input
Gas Volume		(dscfm)		optional input
2 Full Load Engine Exhaust Composition:				Comments
Oxygen (O ₂)		(vol. %)		optional input
Carbon Dioxide (CO ₂)		(vol. %)		optional input
Water (H ₂ O)		(vol. %)		optional input
Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx)		(ppmvd)		optional input
Nitrogen (N ₂)		(vol. %)		optional input
NOx	23.1 lb/hr		0.170 (lb/MMBtu)	NOx emissions from test Data: 173.9 lb/MMSCF ~0.170 lb/MMBtu
3 Engine Parameters				Comments
Total Operating Hours per Season	8760	(hrs)	100.0% utilization	
4 Final Exhaust Gas Composition				Comments
Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx)	5.8 lb/hr		0.043 (lb/MMBtu)	Assume 75% reduction
5 Economic Parameters				Comments
Source of Cost Data	see Analysis			Analysis primarily relying on EPA Cost Manual
Direct Costs		Cost Formula		Comments
Combustion Control Equipment and Auxiliary Equipment	\$3,000,000	(A)		Updated per AeriNox proposal for SCR system hardware costs (\$3,300,000); tempering air needed to ensure exhaust temperature <900F
Instrumentation	\$300,000	(0.1*A)		
Sales Taxes	\$0	(0.03*(A+instrumentation))		No Oregon sales tax
Freight	\$185,000	(0.05*A)		Updated per freight estimate in AeriNox proposal
Purchased Equipment Cost (PEC)	\$3,485,000	PEC		
6 Direct Installation Costs		Cost Formula		Comments
Foundations and Supports	\$278,800	(0.08*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Handling and Erection	\$487,900	(0.14*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Electrical	\$139,400	(0.04*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Piping	\$69,700	(0.02*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Insulation for ductwork	\$34,850	(0.01*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Painting	\$34,850	(0.01*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Site Preparation	\$0	SP		Cost included with next row
Buildings	\$1,035,000	Bldg		Quote for major reconstruction to accommodate retrofit
Total Installation Cost (TIC)	\$2,080,500			
Total Direct Costs (PEC+TIC)	\$5,565,500			

Table 2 (continued).

7 Indirect Costs		Cost Formula		Comments
Engineering	\$348,500	(0.10*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Construction and field expenses	\$174,250	(0.05*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Contractor fees	\$348,500	(0.10*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Start-up	\$69,700	(0.02*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Performance test	\$34,850	(0.01*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Contingencies	\$104,550	(0.03*PEC)		Calculated Cost using EPA Control Cost Manual
Total Indirect Costs (IC)	\$1,080,350	(0.31*PEC)		
8 Capital Cost Summary				Comments
Total Direct Capital Costs (DC)	\$5,565,500			
Total Indirect Capital Costs (IC)	\$1,080,350			
Total Capital Investment (TCI)	\$6,645,850			
9 Direct Annual Costs		Cost Formula		Comments
Operator Labor	\$26,000	nominal cost		5 hours per week (1 hr x 5 days); job category labor rate
Supervisor Labor	\$3,900			15% of operator
Operating Materials - ammonia	\$70,825			materials estimates: 7.7 gals aqueous NH ₃ /hr at cost of \$1.05 / gallon
Maintenance - Labor	\$26,000	nominal cost		5 hours per week (1 hr x 5 days); job category labor rate
Maintenance - Materials	\$8,000	nominal cost		Updated per AeriNOx quote for annual service parts
Catalyst maintenance / replacement	\$150,000			Engineering Estimate (5% of Cap Cost)
Testing and QA/QC	\$20,000			Engineering estimate - Annual test; reagent controller QA
Electricity	\$2,500			Estimate based on analysis in PA DEP TSD
Total Direct Annual Costs	\$307,225			
10 Indirect Annual Costs		Cost Formula	Capital Recovery Factor	Comments
Overhead	\$38,340	(0.6*(OL+SL+ML+MM))		
Administrative Charges	\$132,917	(0.02*TCI)		Engine ACT Document
Property Taxes	\$66,459	(0.01*TCI)		Engine ACT Document
Insurance	\$66,459	(0.01*TCI)		
Capital Recovery	\$350,236	CRF[TCI]	CRF 0.0527	Factor for costs annualized over 30 years at 3.25% interest.
Total Indirect Annual Costs	\$654,410			CRF = $i * (1+i)^n / [(1+i)^n - 1]$ (i expressed as a decimal - e.g., 10% = 0.1)
11 Summary				Comments
Total Direct Annual Operating Costs	\$307,225			
Total Indirect Annual Operating Costs	\$654,410			
Total Annual Costs	\$961,635		\$67 \$ per hp	
Incremental Annual Costs Over Baseline	\$961,635			
12 Annual Emissions Reduction Over Baseline				Comments
Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx)	75.87 (Tons)			
Cost Effectiveness (\$/Ton)				Comments
Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx) - \$ per ton	\$12,676			PSEL basis: significantly over-estimates utilization